# WISCONSIN DEPARTMENT OF REGULATION & LICENSING



# Wisconsin Department of Regulation & Licensing Access to the Public Records of the Reports of Decisions

This Reports of Decisions document was retrieved from the Wisconsin Department of Regulation & Licensing website. These records are open to public view under Wisconsin's Open Records law, sections 19.31-19.39 Wisconsin Statutes.

### Please read this agreement prior to viewing the Decision:

- The Reports of Decisions is designed to contain copies of all orders issued by credentialing authorities within the Department of Regulation and Licensing from November, 1998 to the present. In addition, many but not all orders for the time period between 1977 and November, 1998 are posted. Not all orders issued by a credentialing authority constitute a formal disciplinary action.
- Reports of Decisions contains information as it exists at a specific point in time in the
  Department of Regulation and Licensing data base. Because this data base changes
  constantly, the Department is not responsible for subsequent entries that update, correct or
  delete data. The Department is not responsible for notifying prior requesters of updates,
  modifications, corrections or deletions. All users have the responsibility to determine whether
  information obtained from this site is still accurate, current and complete.
- There may be discrepancies between the online copies and the original document. Original documents should be consulted as the definitive representation of the order's content. Copies of original orders may be obtained by mailing requests to the Department of Regulation and Licensing, PO Box 8935, Madison, WI 53708-8935. The Department charges copying fees. All requests must cite the case number, the date of the order, and respondent's name as it appears on the order.
- Reported decisions may have an appeal pending, and discipline may be stayed during the
  appeal. Information about the current status of a credential issued by the Department of
  Regulation and Licensing is shown on the Department's Web Site under "License Lookup."
  The status of an appeal may be found on court access websites at:
  <a href="http://ccap.courts.state.wi.us/InternetCourtAccess">http://ccap.courts.state.wi.us/InternetCourtAccess</a> and <a href="http://www.courts.state.wi.us/wscca">http://www.courts.state.wi.us/licenses</a>.
- Records not open to public inspection by statute are not contained on this website.

By viewing this document, you have read the above and agree to the use of the Reports of Decisions subject to the above terms, and that you understand the limitations of this on-line database.

**Correcting information on the DRL website:** An individual who believes that information on the website is inaccurate may contact the webmaster at <a href="web@drl.state.wi.gov">web@drl.state.wi.gov</a>

IN THE MATTER OF THE DISCIPLINARY

PROCEEDINGS AGAINST

FINAL DECISION AND ORDER

NELIDA VALENTIN, RESPONDENT.

LS07091218APP

Division of Enforcement Case No. 06 APP 080

The parties to this action for the purpose of Wis. Stat. § 227.53 are:

Nelida Valentin 1552 N. 52nd Street Milwaukee, WI 53208

Wisconsin Real Estate Appraisers Board P.O. Box 8935 Madison, WI 53708

Department of Regulation and Licensing Division of Enforcement P.O. Box 8935 Madison, WI 53708-8935

The parties in this matter agree to the terms and conditions of the attached Stipulation as the final disposition of this matter, subject to the approval of the Real Estate Appraisers Board (Board). The Board has reviewed this Stipulation and considers it acceptable.

Accordingly, the Board in this matter adopts the attached Stipulation and makes the following Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law and Order:

#### FINDINGS OF FACT

- Nelida Valentin (DOB 10/22/67) is a duly licensed appraiser in the state of Wisconsin having license #4-1747, which was first granted on 02/24/04. 1.
- Ms. Valentin's most recent address on file with the Wisconsin Department of Regulation and Licensing is 1552 N. 52<sup>nd</sup> Street, Milwaukee, WI 53208. 2.
- On or about February 12, 2006, Ms. Valentin prepared a written appraisal report on behalf of mortgage lender Money Choice for property located at 1625 Lake WI 53172. Drive Milwaukee, Ms. Valentin concluded that the property had a market value
- The appraisal for the 1625 Lake View Drive, South Milwaukee, WI property was reviewed by the Department and it was determined that the appraisal violated the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) in the following respects:
- a. <u>Standards Rule 1-4(a) Sales Comparison Approach</u> by the selection of comparables. The sales selected all have better curb appeal and are properties that are 7 years old (Sale 1), 2 years old (Sale 2), 2 years old (Sale 3), and 12 years old (Sale 4)—these properties are significantly different from the subject property which the appraisal identifies as being 78 years old. This is evident from the photographs alone, which are attached and incorporated herein as *Exhibit A*. The comparables selected are all in Oak Creek, whereas the subject property is in South Milwaukee. The comparables selected are all new or relatively new homes in newer subdivisions. The appraisal states that "[t]he subject and comparables were all similar in size, style, condition and location" and "[a]ll comparable sales have similarities [to] the subject in design and overall amenity." Yet the subject property is a 1.5 story bungalow built in 1927 and the comparables are all quite clearly 2 story homes that are not at all similar in style, condition or location. The appraisal states that the subject is in "average condition" and the quality of construction is identified as "Average" but also identifies the comparables, which are significantly newer homes, as having "Average" quality of construction and being in "Similar" condition to the subject property. Also, Sale 2 has a deck and full bathroom in the basement that were not adjusted for.
- b. <u>Standards Rule 1-5 (b) Prior Sales</u> by failing to analyze all sales of the subject property that occurred within the three (3) years prior to the effective date of the appraisal. Per the South Milwaukee Assessor, the subject property also sold in June 2005 for \$222,500, which is only eight months prior to Ms. Valentin appraising the property at \$287,000. Ms. Valentin's explanation that this sale did not show up on her MLS search is inadequate—due diligence was not performed in verifying and analyzing the prior sales history.
- Standards Rule 1-1 Developing an Appraisal by failing to be aware of, understand, and correctly employ those recognized methods and techniques that are necessary to produce a credible appraisal and by committing a substantial error of commission that significantly affects the appraisal; and Standards Rule 2-1 Misleading Report by failing to clearly and accurately set forth the appraisal in a manner that will not be misleading, by the combination of the concerns detailed above.
- 5. Ms. Valentin was disciplined by the Board in February 2007 for an appraisal completed in 2004. One of the violations was her failure to analyze all sales of the subject property—she relied solely on MLS data and missed a prior sale of the subject property.

## CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- The Wisconsin Real Estate Appraisers Board has jurisdiction to act in this matter pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 458.26, and is authorized to enter in the attached Stipulation pursuant to Wis. Stat. § 227.44(5).
  - The conduct described above in paragraph 4 constitutes a violation of:

    - a. USPAP Standards Rule 1-4(a), Sales Comparison Approach; b. USPAP Standards Rule 1-5(b), Analyze All Sales within Prior 3 years; c. USPAP Standards Rule 1-1, Developing and Appraisal; and

    - d. USPAP Standards Rule 2-1, Misleading Report
- As a result of the above USPAP violations, Ms. Valentin is deemed to have also violated Wis. Admin. Code § 86.01(2), thereby subjecting herself to discipline pursuant to Wis. Admin. Code § 86.01(1) and Wis. Stat. § 458.26(3)(b) and (c).

#### **ORDER**

#### NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that:

- 1. The appraiser license of Respondent **Nelida Valentin**, license # 4-1747, is hereby **SUSPENDED for NINETY (90) DAYS**, beginning thirty (30) days from the date of this Order. Ms. Valentin shall not engage in the practice of real estate appraisal during the term of her license suspension.
  - 2. Respondent Nelida Valentin shall, within 60 days of the date of this Order, pay COSTS of this matter in the amount of \$550.00
- 3. Payment of costs (made payable to the Wisconsin Department of Regulation and Licensing) shall be mailed or delivered to the Department Monitor at this address:

Department Monitor

Division of Enforcement
Department of Regulation and Licensing
P.O. Box 8935, Madison, WI 53708-8935
Telephone (608) 261-7904, Fax (608) 266-2264

- 4. Violation of any of the terms of this Order may be construed as conduct imperiling public health, safety and welfare and may result in a summary suspension of Respondent's license. The Board in its discretion may in the alternative impose additional conditions and limitations or other additional discipline for a violation of any of the terms of this Order. In the event Respondent fails to timely submit payment of the costs as set forth above, Ms. Valentin's license (# 4-1747) SHALL BE SUSPENDED, without further notice or hearing, until Ms.Valentin has complied with the terms of this Order.
  - This Order is effective on the date of its signing.

WISCONSIN REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD

by: Marla Britton 9/12/07 A Member of the Board Date